



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

[00:00:00] **Mandy Matney:** I don't know why the State Attorney General's Office hasn't come out stronger against Dick and Jim's accusations about the spatter allegedly found on Alex's shirt. But I do have to give the prosecution credit for finally confirming so many of the things we have been saying all along about Alex Murdaugh, the Murdaugh family, and what allegedly led to Maggie and Paul's deaths. My name is Mandy Matney. I have been investigating the Murdaugh family for almost four years now. This is the Murdaugh Murders Podcast, written with Liz Ferrell and produced by my husband, David Moses.

[00:01:01] Okay. This has been a big week for us at Luna Shark with the official launch of our MMP Premium membership platform tomorrow, December 15th. That is a big deal for us and, hopefully, for the future of journalism, which we so badly wanna change. Over the past year and a half, I've received hundreds of messages from our fans asking what they can do to support the kind of journalism that we do at MMP. So many of you have said that you wanna see more of it in different cases across the country, and MMP Premium powered by Supercast is the answer that we have finally come up with that will give you, our supporters, more access, more engagement, more information, and more opportunities while giving us the financial support to properly fund journalists across the country to expose the truth wherever it leads, to give a voice to the voiceless, and to get the story straight.

[00:02:08] If you go to [mmp.supercast.com](https://mmp.supercast.com) right now, you can reserve your spot in this inspiring community that we are starting. For either \$7 or \$14 a month, depending on what you pick, you will get access to exclusive documents, transcripts, and charts. The membership also includes access to our Discord channel, where you can chat live with the Luna Shark team and ask us questions, sort of like an ongoing group chat. I personally have been loving the Discord channel, and I am going to shift most of my social media time to there. Facebook, Twitter, and even Instagram have been really toxic for me in the last couple years as I've been subjected to a lot of targeted harassment and hate. And this Discord channel allows me to communicate directly with our biggest fans and supporters, which is honestly the best part of social media, without having to fight the trolls. This platform also allows you to get access to our live hearings and trial coverage — an absolute necessity for the next couple of months. Eric Alan will be broadcasting every major



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

court event related to the Murdaugh cases. And Eric Bland, Liz, and I will be providing live commentary to make sense of everything. Only MMP Premium members get access to the hearings and we don't want you to miss out. And that is just the beginning. We plan on adding more features as we grow, including things like short classes about how to FOIA and how to get access to documents.

[00:03:53] So, please, if you believe in us, I urge you to go to [mmp.supercast.com](http://mmp.supercast.com) and join today. If half of you listening right now signed up, I can't imagine how much corruption we would be able to expose, cases we could be able to solve in lives that we could change in the next year. I am motivated and feel obligated to change journalism for the better and hire an army, a brilliant journalist, pay them what they're worth, and show so many other news agencies how all of this is possible when you focus on doing the right thing instead of allowing those at the top to be selfish and greedy. So, please, we have gifted you this free podcast, and if you want to give back, go to [mmp.supercast.com](http://mmp.supercast.com). Thank you.

[00:04:52] Okay, so let's get into all of the most recent happenings with the double homicide case against Alex Murdaugh. In the last few weeks, we have learned a lot about both the evidence, particularly the blood spatter, and the motive in the double homicide through various motions in Friday's hearing. So, today, we are going to go over everything new we have learned in both Creighton's motion and the hearing when it comes to Alex Murdaugh's alleged motive. And then, we're going to talk about the dirty details of the blood spatter evidence that has managed to confuse pretty much everyone so far.

[00:05:34] So, let's start with a motive because this is big. Essentially, in response to Dick and Jim's latest filings asking for a motive, Creighton Waters, in both his motion and at the hearing Friday, said, "Look. You asked for the motive. Let's talk about the motive then." And then, he laid out a beautifully detailed summary as to why the state believes Alex Murdaugh killed his wife and son and why they believe motive is such an important part of the case.



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

[00:06:05] **Creighton Waters:** And the reason for that is, Your Honor, is that in this particular case where you have a man who was accused and indicted for the murder of his own wife and son, the motive might be the most important fact that any jury would want know. It's not an — for the defense, but it is the most important fact that any jury is going to want to know in this case. And for a jury to understand that, for them to really understand what the motive is in this particular case, they're going to have to understand that there was a huge difference between who Alex Murdaugh professed to be to the outside of the world and how important that was to him as a central figure in this prominent family and who he really was that only he knew that no one else knew. Over and over again, I've interviewed witnesses or put witnesses on the stand and who thought that they knew this man and they over and over again said, "I didn't know him. I didn't know who this man was." And so, for a jury to understand that, they're going to have to understand not only that distinction between who he professed to be and who he was and how important that was to him, but also how that allowed him to avoid accountability for defrauding victims of almost \$9 million since 2011 that we've been able to detect. I think when this case started, a lot of people assumed that this was a murder case. And then, a few months later, there was some white collar thrown in there. But the reality is is we have done this extensive investigation, state grand jury investigation. We've realized that this is a white-collar case that culminated with two murders.

[00:08:04] **Mandy Matney:** Killing, right? I am not gonna say that I told you so, but I do have to say that hearing Creighton say this after all of the hell Liz and I and others have dealt with in the last four years, we've been in this perpetual cycle of finding out something shocking, eventually working up the bravery to report it and put our names behind it, receiving tons of hate and backlash for reporting what we did, and then months or years later, the very thing that we were scared to report appears in an official document. Hearing Creighton say these words and seeing them in a public document? That was maybe the most vindicating thing for me so far in this case. It felt better than any journalism award I could possibly get, and it made me thankful for all of our sources who continue to stick their necks out behind the scenes, too. There are so many people in this state working to do the right thing, and it has all led to this. As Creighton said, this is a white-collar case that culminated into two murders. In both his motion and at the hearing, Creighton almost



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

poetically laid out just how that happened, and he told us some new information about how Alex's financial crisis started with some bad land deals around 2008 when the market was crashing. And don't worry. We've been looking into this for a while and we will talk more about that in a future episode.

[00:09:41] **Creighton Waters:** But I think the important point to realize is that this is an unbroken chain of constant lies and misappropriations and thefts that has been going on for so long — a hamster wheel on which this man has been on, constantly having to borrow, to earn, to steal millions of dollars just to keep kicking the can down the road and staying above water; an exhausting hamster wheel; a slow burn that was heating up and heating up until June 7th, 2021. And that all started with some land deals in 2008. 2007, 2008, the recession hit and he really ended up upside down on those land deals and it materially changed his financial picture. The reason why we know that, Your Honor, is that an early part of this past decade, in 2011, he had some big cases. He had the Pinckney case. He had the Thomas case. He had the Badger case. And these cases, the people around him thought — they knew he had some issues and had some problems, but they thought that those recoveries and those really high fees that he'd obtained — six figures or more — had fixed the financial problems that Alex Murdaugh had. But they didn't; they weren't enough. And not only did he have huge fees from those particular cases, but he also sold money from the clients as well. Your Honor, if I look at the unbroken chain that I'm talking about here of these thefts that went on, they start in 2011. And every single year from 2011 to 2021, he stole money from clients. It is an unbroken chain because even though he was making six and sometimes seven figures of legitimate income in his law practice, it was not enough to sustain the lifestyle that he had and the debts that he had; even though he was borrowing millions of dollars from Palmetto State Bank, from his buddy Russell Laffitte; borrowing close to a million dollars from his law partner; borrowing hundreds of thousands of dollars from his father; borrowing hundreds of thousands of dollars from Russell Laffitte's father; having Russell Laffitte loan him close to a million dollars from the Plyler money for which he had — It still wasn't enough. It wasn't enough to keep Alex Murdaugh's head above water. And it couldn't stop. It couldn't stop. I've detailed in the filing and Your Honor's generally familiar with the state grand jury evidence of the four manners in which he was stealing money,



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

including from his own family and his law firm, and he'd been doing that for a long time. But one thing happened that caused the slow burn to finally heat up, and that was the boat case in February of 2019.

[00:13:03] **Liz Farrell:** As we've said all along, the boat crash case was the beginning of the end of the Murdaugh dynasty. It's the event that changed everything for Alex Murdaugh. It is the ground zero of this case. Now, in the motion and at the hearing, Creighton had explained how Alex was facing four major problems at the time of the murders. There was the missing Chris Wilson fee; the multiple subpoenas in the boat crash obstruction case and at least one of those subpoenas was for bank records, according to one of our sources; there was the looming deadline in which Alex would be forced to disclose his finances to the boat crash victims; and then there was also Randolph Murdaugh's grim prognosis in April. In some way or another, all of these are related to the boat crash case.

[00:13:45] So, the first and perhaps the most immediate problem Alex was facing at the time is that PMPED was demanding answers about the missing fee from a case that Alex and Chris Wilson had worked on together. Chris Wilson plays a critical role in the events that led to Alex Murdaugh allegedly murdering his wife and son. Specifically, in the spring of 2021, Alex had what Creighton called one possible saving grace for his mounting financial problems, and that was a settlement in two cases that he had worked on with Chris Wilson, who was a longtime friend of his. Now, this isn't the first time Wilson's name has come up officially in all of this. Remember Wilson was the third attorney on that infamous private plane that Cory Fleming and Alex had taken to the College World Series in 2012. Cory's client, Pamela Pinckney, unknowingly paid for that flight. Wilson's name came up again in Alex's December 2021 bond hearing. When Alex made it a point to try and publicly absolve Wilson and Fleming, his two closest friends, from his shenanigans in court, Murdaugh said Wilson was, quote, one of his oldest and dearest friends who, quote, didn't know anything and didn't do anything wrong. Chris Wilson is apparently also a part of Alex's ever-changing alibi. He was one of the many people Alex called on the night of June 7th. And according to testimony during the Russell Laffitte trial, Chris had helped Alex keep PMPED's suspicions at bay by backing up Alex's alleged lies about where the fee was. But it seems like Wilson's most important role in all of this is what he did with



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

the \$792,000 in fees on those two cases he had shared with Alex Murdaugh in 2021.

[00:15:26] **Creighton Waters:** There's \$792,000 in fees for Mr. Murdaugh. But what he does is he convinces his co-counsel on that case to write those fees directly to him instead of writing it to the firm. And why is that? So that he can get that money right away, bypass the firm where it's supposed to be. And so, he does that. Three quarters of a million dollars and it's gone within a very, very short period of time.

[00:15:54] **Mandy Matney:** According to previous indictments, Alex basically told Chris that he was trying to hide money from Mallory Beach's family, as he had a big lawsuit looming and one of his insurance providers had already said they wouldn't be covering him. What he was asking Chris to do is highly unethical, and Chris Wilson should have absolutely known better than to believe Alex. But Chris, like so many other men who have managed to have prestigious jobs that require logical thinking, also claims that he was duped by Alex Murdaugh the Super Duper. And he was just like, okay, buddy. I'll write you a check. And so, those pesky PMPED folks won't see a thing. I honestly wonder if Maggie and Paul would've been murdered if Chris Wilson had done the right thing in the spring of 2021 and told Alex that's against the rules; that could get me and you in trouble — absolutely not. And then, he should have told the solicitor's office and PMPED what Alex, their employee, was trying to do. And honestly, I cannot believe that the ODC is still allowing Chris Wilson to be a lawyer right now, considering that this unethical behavior in 2021, whether or not it was a simple lapse in judgment, led to so much destruction. I feel like a lot of lawyers have been suspended for actions that had much less serious consequences. Also, I have to mention, Wilson is represented by Bakari Sellers, one of the state's most famous attorneys and politicians who is close with Dick Harpootlian. Sellers is also a Murdaugh family friend who also said that the Murdaugh family is the salt of the Earth in *People* magazine last year and called Alex Murdaugh a kind and gentle soul, which is, hm.

[00:17:57] Anyways, instead of Chris Wilson doing the right thing, he apparently wrote the check to Alex, which led to PMPED confronting Alex on the day of the murders, which leads us to big problem number two: the state



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

grand jury subpoenas related to the boat crash criminal case that were apparently also threatening to reveal Alex big and very illegal financial disaster. We have reported on those subpoenas in the past, but Creighton's motion was the first time they were mentioned on the record. I'm gonna have David read this part.

[00:18:34] **David Moses:** On top of this. In March, April, and May of 2021, state grand jury subpoenas about the boat crash case were issued for testimony or documents to various witnesses and institutions with a connection or presence in Hampton and the 14th Circuit.

[00:18:55] **Mandy Matney:** And we'll be right back.

[00:19:02] **Liz Farrell:** So, we've been reading Creighton's writing for over a year now, and we're noticing he seems to drop a lot of subtle hints or vague statements that don't make sense until later or that come into much sharper focus the more we put together the pieces. He's sort of like the creator of *The White Lotus* who dropped major clues throughout season two and drove us all crazy trying to figure it out. Let's hope this ending is much less tragic than that one was though. It's very interesting that Creighton mentioned Alex's coworkers in the 14th Circuit, possibly knowing about the subpoenas at the time and adding to the pressure that Alex was feeling. This suddenly hints at the possibility of corruption in the 14th Circuit Solicitor's Office, and I'm wondering if Creighton is intentionally including this to say, "Hey. You guys are definitely not in the clear when it comes to the Murdaughs." At the hearing, Jim said that Alex didn't know about the subpoenas, but we all know Jim and Alex's track records on accurately stating reality at this point.

[00:20:01] **Jim Griffin:** And as Your Honor knows that, there's no doomsday reckoning in that regard for the civil case. The other issue that he raises, oh, state grand jury, is issuing subpoenas for public corruption or something in connection with the boating accident case. There's no evidence that Alex Murdaugh knew of those subpoenas. No evidence of — I don't even know if we've been provided those subpoenas, Your Honor.



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

[00:20:26] **Mandy Matney:** Hm. Creighton did not say those subpoenas were about public corruption. I wonder why Jim said that and what he really knows about those subpoenas. So, the third big problem that Alex was facing on June 7th was the upcoming hearing in the boat crash case on June 10th, which we have been telling y'all about for 18 months now. We always knew that date, where a judge would likely order Alex to reveal all of the dirty details of his finances to the Beach family, had something to do with the murders in some way. It was just too weird. The recent motion and hearing revealed that there is evidence of Alex being concerned about this June 10th hearing. On June 7th, the day of the murders, Alex was apparently in his office working on disclosures in the boat crash case and preparing for the financial hearing on June 10th. At Friday's hearing, Jim Griffin added a very interesting tidbit to this.

[00:21:35] **Jim Griffin:** And the extent of what would have been ordered in a practical, in most every case, is a financial statement. And in fact, the evidence is that Mr. Murdaugh had handwritten out a financial statement for purposes of that hearing. All he had to do was produce a financial statement, Your Honor, a statement of net worth.

[00:21:56] **Liz Farrell:** Whoa, okay. So, Maggie and Paul were murdered on the same day Alex was taking a look at its finances and apparently had decided to make some sort of wacky, handwritten document, which, by the way, only someone as privileged as Alex Murdaugh would ever think of doing such a thing — turning in a bunch of scribbles about his bank accounts as an official record of his finances. Think about it though. He was sitting there at that desk, likely realizing that everything in his life was about to hit the fan if the court forced him to reveal his financial records. Also, on this day, the day he was coming face-to-face with his finances and the world finding out what he had been doing, he was also confronted by PMPED about the missing \$792,000 fee. That is a lot of pressure in the hours before Maggie and Paul were killed.

[00:22:43] Finally, the fourth big stressor facing Alex Murdaugh: his father was dying. And while he was getting confronted by PMPED, he allegedly got a phone call telling him that his father had taken a turn for the worst. As you





## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

guys know, Randolph was the longtime solicitor of the 14th Circuit and he was a legend in law enforcement and in the legal community in this region. He's the guy who pulled all the strings for Alex and Alex's sons. He's the guy who worked all of the magic and held most of the power in that family across the state. He was dying of cancer. Creighton was sure to include in his latest motion that Randolph had previously loaned Alex money or had cosigned loans for him. So, Randolph dying was a big problem for Alex Murdaugh because his savior was about to leave him all alone in this world. We hope to find out more about what was going on with Randolph at the time because while we know he was dying of cancer that week, we still have a lot of questions about that timeline and we hope those questions get answered at trial.

[00:23:46] **Creighton Waters:** All of this is finally coming to a head. That morning, a PMPED staffer comes in — and says, "Alex, I need an answer today. Where is that money? I need an answer today." And Alex is in his office working on the boat case because that hearing is scheduled for June 10th and Judge Hall has made it very clear there's gonna be no more continuances and that's gonna expose everything as well. And the only thing that stops the conversation about "I need an answer right now" is that Alex unfortunately gets a call that Mr. Randolph had gone to the hospital with very poor prognosis — his father, who repeatedly had loaned him hundreds of thousands of dollars when he needed it. All of those are happening on this very day. It's a day of reckoning for him — the very day that Maggie and Paul were murdered. And what happens in the wake of that? What happens is the exact opposite happens. Everybody immediately rallies to his aid. Immediately, that hearing is canceled. Let's not even reschedule it anytime soon. The PMPED people who would be, the last thing they're worried about is where these fees are. They don't care about that anymore. They're all rallying to his aid. All of the things that were about to happen stopped.

[00:25:24] **Mandy Matney:** Now, that sounds familiar, right? And think about it. How are Dick and Jim going to be able to convince a jury that the superstorm swirling around Alex Murdaugh and his financial crimes reaching a pinnacle for pressure on the day of the double homicide was a complete coincidence? Creighton said this so clearly in his motion, quote, Murdaugh



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

was the only individual with a true motive to kill his wife and son. It is going to be wild to see Dick and Jim try to convince a jury otherwise.

[00:26:05] So, the state wants to use evidence of Alex's alleged crimes to help show the extent of Alex's motive and his frame of mind at the time of the murders. During Friday's hearing, Dick and Jim argued that all of that financial stuff and that boat crash stuff is just character evidence that should be thrown out. Jim used the term "bad dude" several times when referring to what the state is proving his client to be.

[00:26:35] **Jim Griffin:** The — should be given the benefit of the doubt and the evidence should be rejected, as stated in law. And so, Your Honor, in their response to our motion to bill of particulars, they say, we've known all of those since January 2022; that he's been charged in 18 indictments over 90 separate counts. And we've been given discovery on that. And all that is true and we have all that. And it's a universe of information and he gave a great opening, closing, whatever argument he wants to give to the jury to paint Mr. Murdaugh as a bad guy. But the most important part of our motion for bill of particulars was to identify that universal balance you intend to offer at trial and how is it relevant? What is this, how does it heed the asset test of logical relevancy to the particular exception?

[00:27:35] **Liz Farrell:** Well, Judge Newman won't rule on that quite yet. I do wanna talk to you guys about a case called State v. Lyle real quick. The State Attorney General's Office is using this case in an effort to get its evidence of motive entered into the record for the Murdaugh trial. Lyle created a precedent that allows prosecutors to bring in evidence showing what's called a common scheme. They're particularly able to argue this in cases of rape or child sex abuse. The common scheme is basically evidence that shows that the crime the defendant is being accused of now fits into a larger pattern of behavior or habit from what's called prior bad acts that they've been accused of before. And they don't have to have been found guilty of those prior bad acts either. But the evidence of a common scheme can't be prejudicial, meaning it can't only speak to the defendant's character. The test or, as they were calling it at the hearing, the acid test is whether or not the scheme is related to the current crime. So, in this case, the common scheme is Alex



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

allegedly trying to cover up his financial misgivings because of the boat crash. And in the hearing, Creighton was like, oh, it's related and Alex made it relevant, and here's how he did that.

[00:28:50] **Creighton Waters:** When we talk about the acid test of Lyle and what that really refers to is that logical connection. And I think I heard Mr. Griffin even say, okay, he's identified the connection. But let's talk about that logical connection. Within 30 seconds of the first deputy who arrived on the scene on the night of June 7th 2021, Alex Murdaugh said, "My son's been involved in this boat case. I know that's what it is." He, within 30 seconds of the deputy arriving, starts talking about the boat case. He made it immediately relevant.

[00:29:31] **Mandy Matney:** Whoa. So, I wanna pause and repeat what he is saying here. We have been hearing for 18 months that the Murdaugh camp was trying to convince the public that the boat crash victims were somehow to blame for the double homicide due to some kind of act of revenge. We saw some evidence of this when Alex's brothers, Randy and John Marvin, cried on *Good Morning America* last June, and they planted those seeds, insinuating that Paul had gotten threats about the boat crash and that they should have taken them more seriously. Mainstream media really took this theory and ran with it. Headlines about Paul Murdaugh being threatened because of the boat crash were landing in big papers across the country. And this actually was a main motivator for us to start this podcast. It seemed like I was one of the only ones covering this story who knew that the murders could not have been an act of revenge for the boat crash and knew if anyone had the power to pin this on the wrong people, it would be the Murdaughs. And here we are, now knowing that Alex was planting those seeds and pointing the finger at the boat crash victims right out of the gates in the double homicide investigation. And Creighton said in the hearing that Alex himself making that connection is a big deal and makes all of the boat crash evidence and financial evidence fair game.

[00:31:13] **Creighton Waters:** And then, if you start to walk that logical connection back, how do you explain what that means? What is the boat case without explaining what the boat case is? And then, how do you explain how



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

that can matter to him so much if you don't start walking back — what all that means to his status and his finances and, more importantly, to uncovering or protecting from being uncovered who he really was. He says in my motion that I just wanna show that he's a bad guy. And that's not the case. And the case law is very clear about that; if it's evidence of motive, the fact that it also shows the existence of another crime does not make it — if it is valid evidence of motive. He tries to distinguish the cases that we've cited, talking about longstanding financial crimes as being the motive for murder, and said, well, in those cases, they were trying, he was trying to kill the victim of those financial crimes before they just outed the defendant. Well, it's the same thing here, Your Honor. It's just this case is different. This case is unique. This case is more complex. He's still trying to prevent who he really is from being outed. But unlike those cases where you have a specific victim who had been victimized who's gotta testify in court and you can just kill them now, he can't kill everybody. He can't kill 11 years' worth of victims. He can't do that. But what he does do, what he does do is kill his wife and son who were liabilities in the boat case. And immediately, it stops everything. Immediately, it stops that day of reckoning. Immediately, he no longer has to answer that question about those fees; that if it failed to be answered, was gonna leave the firm to do exactly what they'd end up doing three months later and uncovering it all.

[00:33:10] **Mandy Matney:** He can't kill them all. Wow. This was perhaps the most powerful statement Creighton has made so far in this case. He is saying here that Alex is capable of anything. And if Alex could have killed all of his financial victims to get out of this mess, he would have, but there was just too many. How horrific is that thought? That is the kind of portrait the state is painting of Alex Murdaugh and his motive — a man who would stop at nothing to get what he wants.

[00:33:52] And this is important. I've seen some people in our Discord channel and online talking about how they think the state's motive is weak and doesn't make any sense; that Alex was just buying time and not actually fixing any of the problems coming at him. But think about this. Think about all of the things that Alex is accused of doing that we have talked about on this podcast: stealing from the poor, the disabled, the vulnerable; taking money from children; framing another kid for the boat crash; continuing to scheme



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

after his wife and son were murdered; partying in Key West weeks after the double homicide; and then, staging a suicide-for-hire situation so his only surviving son could get an insurance payout. None of that is rational. But the important part that we need to understand about the state's theory and that Creighton said several times on Friday, this kind of madness worked for Alex for his entire life and even after the double homicide. And momentarily, it worked after the Labor Day incident.

[00:35:13] And speaking of that very odd Labor Day shooting, Creighton told us something on Friday that we hadn't heard before. He said right before that shooting happened, Alex met up with Chris Wilson to finally talk about those missing fees.

[00:35:32] **Creighton Waters:** September 4th. His best friend, who he had convinced to send back those fees to PMPED that should cover \$192,000 with his own money that Alex couldn't borrow enough to pay, is trying to get ahold of him and finally gets to meet with him on the doorstep, on the front porch of Alex's mother's house. And Alex confesses to him — bills and that he's been stealing and he doesn't have \$192,000. All that accountability is starting to crash down on Alex again. And what happens? Within a couple hours of that conversation with his best friend confronting him about \$192,000, Alex is the victim on the side of the road. And instantly, everybody rallies to his aid again. Accountability's coming on him and suddenly, there's a gunshot and he's a victim again. And everybody rushes to his aid again, except this time, it doesn't take long for people to figure out that something's not right here.

[00:36:50] **Liz Farrell:** We'll be right back.

[00:36:56] Okay. So, that was the Big Creighton energy portion of the hearing. He ended it strongly. We'll give him that. But the hearing started off much more problematically with an issue that we hope SLED and the Attorney General's Office are able to explain soon because until then, we're left with the headlines that Dick and Jim want, meaning headlines that call into question the viability of the spatter evidence, which up until Friday, were 100% based on Dick and Jim's claims alone. Now, in part because of Little Creighton



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

energy, the state has added some legitimacy to Dick and Jim's assertions about the spatter, and obviously that could be troubling.

[00:37:35] **Mandy Matney:** So like we've said before, the defense's motions and arguments in court seem mostly designed for the headlines and for Dick and Jim to educate the judge in their own way. As such, Dick and Jim are only telling the court the parts of the story that they think help their argument. But without a full view or understanding of the investigation, it is hard to piece together what they say happened here, especially during such a fast-paced hearing. But we're going to do it.

[00:38:09] **Liz Farrell:** So, the shirt. Let's talk about that now. On the night of the murders, Alex was apparently wearing a white T-shirt with a pocket on the chest with the words "Black Sheep Hampton South Carolina" written on it. Now, "Black Sheep" is the name of his brother John Marvin's boat and his charter fishing company. Shortly after the murders, this shirt was referred to by someone with knowledge of the case as an "undershirt." We don't know if this person called it an undershirt because it kind of looks like one or if Alex was wearing the shirt under an unbuttoned button-up or light jacket of some sort. We also don't know whether investigators believe he had changed clothes at any point before police got there. We do know that at least one person who was at the scene later commented that Alex appeared to be remarkably untouched by the blood, even for a man who had come home to find bodies. According to the photo that Dick and Jim included with their motions, the shirt did not appear to have that many stains on it as far as stains that are immediately identifiable as blood go. In fact, it just looks like a ratty old T-shirt with a few non-specific stains on it, like one year grandpa might wear when doing yard work. Along the hemline of the shirt are a few small spots that could be blood and there's a spot by the chest, but that's really all you can see from the photo Dick and Jim included. Literally, Alex could have gone to Tractor Supply in that shirt that night and no one would've guessed that he was at the scene of a double murder earlier.

[00:39:40] **Mandy Matney:** Alex says any bloodstains on his shirt are from when he checked Maggie and Paul for signs of life. We have not seen photos of the shorts that he was wearing, so we don't know just how covered in blood



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

those were. But if we're going by just the shirt, either Maggie and Paul were not bleeding all that much, and we know they must have been, or Alex didn't touch their bodies to any great extent. Again, Alex says Maggie and Paul were already dead when he got home. He does not appear to have tried CPR on either one. And this is important because if he had, it might have accounted for some of the spatter on his shirt.

[00:40:24] Okay. Two days after the murders, SLED had tested a part of the shirt with a chemical that turns the area where there's blood a bright pink. According to the shirt motion, SLED then tested that area for DNA, which later came back as Maggie's. In July 2021, SLED then tested the shirt using another chemical that tests for the presence of blood on items. This chemical turned the areas with blood a bright blue or purple color. So, now, the shirt looked a lot different, according to the photos included in the shirt motion. First, there were a lot more stains on the shirt. The bottom third of the shirt had significant — type staining in the bottom center along the hem. And there was what looked like a collection of very tiny dots on the top two-thirds of the shirt, along with some larger polka dots.

[00:41:28] Now, according to the expert's letter to SLED about his findings, Alex was apparently captured on body cam footage wiping his face with the bottom of his shirt. The expert noted the, quote, the front bottom of the T-shirt has transferred type bloodstains consistent with wiping a sweaty face that has blood on the face. The expert also noted that the spatter stains at the top of the shirt were unaffected by Alex wiping his face with the hem of his shirt. Transfer bloodstains look a lot different from the high-impact velocity spatter that the state says is on the shirt.

[00:42:11] **Liz Farrell:** Now, in testing for blood and spatter and DNA, the shirt was photographed, tested, photographed, cut up, photographed, tested again, photographed. And now, it's completely purple from the testing chemicals. Dick and Jim say this prevents them from having their own experts test the shirt and that even the bloodstain expert hired by SLED had to rely on photographs for his conclusions.



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

[00:42:36] So, let's talk about that. Like we've said before, Dick and Jim want this shirt excluded from evidence for good reason. The state says the shirt contains the markings of high impact velocity spatter containing, according to our sources, brain matter from Maggie that could only have come from standing above her in proximity when she was shot in the head. To get this shirt excluded, they need to do so in an evidentiary hearing and they need to show the judge that a hearing is necessary. So, to do this, they say they need materials that the state has not provided them with, namely, a PowerPoint presentation, notes and emails related to the spatter and the bloodstain expert, and the native files of photos of the shirt, which Dick and Jim say were photoshopped to highlight areas of the spatter. Judge Newman was thrilled to hear this, by the way. He was like, oh, cool, so we're having a hearing to see if we need a hearing. Love that for us.

[00:43:31] Dick and Jim need that hearing so that they can show that investigators destroyed the shirt in bad faith. In other words, they need to show that there are shenanigans going on here. And to do that, they wanna bring in the bloodstain expert and SLED agents to testify so they can hear their explanations for discrepancies that Dick and Jim say exist. So, a few things here. One is the bloodstain expert's final conclusions. He found that there were eight areas of the shirt that had tested positive for blood. There were more than 40 instances of misting-sized blood and there were more than a hundred stains on the front of the shirt that were consistent with spatter. Dick and Jim definitely don't want the jury to hear all that, so they're trying to set up this scenario for the judge and the public in which SLED investigators at some point determined that there was no, quote, human blood on the areas of the shirt where the alleged spatter was. Here's Dick at the hearing.

[00:44:27] **Dick Harpootlian:** Number two: the test run by SLED, which we did not get until a couple three weeks ago, indicated no presence of blood, human blood, which if you're going to have somebody testify that there's blood spatter, I think part of that is there needs to be some blood.

[00:44:49] **Mandy Matney:** So, Dick and Jim say that the blood spatter expert did not find any spatter on the shirt until SLED agents visited him earlier this





## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

year. They say he then changed his mind after the visit. In truth, the expert offered a draft of his preliminary findings and then issued a final report. Again, we don't know what evidence the expert was provided with initially. We don't know anything about the circumstances that led to the preliminary conclusions differing so much from the final conclusions. The expert's reports that are attached to the motion are mostly redacted. And speaking of, another thing Dick and Jim want the judge and the public to believe is that SLED and the AG buried evidence of those discrepancies in the 1.2 million pages of documents they were provided. Apparently, Dick and Jim only found this information because Dick's office had catalogued every bit of evidence into a database. And according to Dick, this is not something most defense attorneys can do. So, Alex is apparently getting what he's paying for there. Anyway, on Friday, Judge Newman granted Dick and Jim's motion to compel, meaning that the state has to provide anything related to the spatter analysis that they haven't already provided. The state says that Dick and Jim have everything there is to have, so it will be interesting to see how this order gets written and whether Creighton raises any objections to it.

[00:46:32] Alright. Now, let's talk more about what happened at the hearing. At best, there's confusion, and Dick and Jim are talking about one thing, and SLED and the AG's Office are referring to another. But at worst, there is a problem here. And if there is not a problem, then Creighton Waters did nothing to clear that up. In fact, he created more room for Dick and Jim to maneuver in. At one point, when Creighton was talking, Jim looked like he was barely trying to suppress the glee he apparently was feeling.

[00:47:14] So, first, I wanna make this clear. We have never reported that Alex had Paul's blood on his clothes or that the state was claiming that there was spray on Alex from Paul's shooting. But during Friday's hearing, Dick seemed under that impression and his arguments repeatedly mentioned that the testing did not support the information that was supposedly leaked to the press. He mentioned this point in graphic detail.

[00:47:46] **Dick Harpootlian:** Your Honor, this is, it was leaked to the press a year ago that Alex Murdaugh had Paul Murdaugh blood spatter; was the shooter because he had blood spatter. That — first of all, SLED will testify



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

there's no blood, so I don't know of any blood spatter. Number two, the DNA spot would exclude Paul — exclude. And number three, we believe the forensic is gonna show that whoever shot Paul Murdaugh, basically blew his head off, would be covered in blood, not just spatter.

[00:48:23] **Liz Farrell:** Now, this is gross, but Dick raises a good point if it's true. And we don't know that it is because like we've told you before, the evidence provided by Dick and Jim with the shirt motion is limited, esoteric, and heavily redacted. How is it that Alex allegedly doesn't have spatter on him from the shotgun blast that killed Paul? There could be a few explanations, but we don't know for sure. One possible explanation is where the gunman might have been standing in relation to Paul. Another is were there any physical elements blocking the gunman from Paul, like a door or a wall? Another is simply physics. Yes, Paul's head was in bad shape, but he wasn't shot in the head directly, as Dick suggests. According to our sources, the shot went in through his arm or shoulder and then to his head. So, we're not experts and we haven't seen the evidence, so we'll end the speculation on that. You know who is an expert though? Tom Bevel of Bevel, Gardner & Associates in Oklahoma. According to a report in *The New York Times* in 2018, Bevel is one of the most sought-after bloodstain experts in the nation, and he's the expert SLED consultant on the spatter. Dick and Jim obviously wanna make this guy out to be a stone-cold idiot and a charlatan. Here's how Dick described him on Friday.

[00:49:43] **Dick Harpootlian:** So, this is critical because this blood spatter, this guy's not a scientist. He looks at something and gives it sort of a rush act test. He'd looked at it and said, nah, no blood spatter. Then he photoshops it and said, yeah, blood spatter. We need to understand why he changed his mind and we'd like to, we believe we need this evidence to get into position. We're gonna assume that he's gonna go forward with it.

[00:50:12] **Mandy Matney:** Now, bloodstain analysis has a complicated history and there have been instances in which men who have been convicted in part because of bloodstain evidence have been exonerated. Unfortunately for Creighton and SLED, Bevel has been tied to at least one of those cases. Dick made a mention of this during trial. In fact, he spelled out the name of the



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

case likely for the media. But Dick being Dick made it sound like Bevell's testimony alone put an innocent man in prison. But we did some digging and, unsurprisingly, Dick is being selective about the facts he's sharing.

[00:50:59] **Liz Farrell:** So, the case Dick brought up was the David Camm case. Camm was a former state trooper in Indiana who, in September 2000 came home to find his wife and two children shot to death in their garage and driveway area. He was arrested a few days later and held without bond for two years while awaiting trial. During his initial interview with authorities, he denied killing his family more than 70 times. Any chance he could get, in fact, Camm proclaimed his innocence and his grief. His attorneys tried to get him out of jail several times. His family supported him openly and loudly. His wife's family said they were withholding judgment until they saw the evidence. In the meantime, his wife's family had a court freeze the wife's assets, so Camm couldn't spend them. Prior to his resignation from the state police department, Camm had been under investigation for beating a citizen during an arrest. He was exonerated, but he left the department because he felt like they didn't have his back on that one.

[00:51:58] During the trial, which was held in 2002, it came out that Camm had had at least 15 extramarital affairs in the years leading up to his family's murders — 15, including one when his wife was pregnant with their second child. At least two of those women testified against him saying that he had lied to them and that he had had violent outbursts, including one involving a handgun. I should also mention that the state had established a strong financial incentive for Camm to kill his family, showing that shortly before the murders, Camm had allegedly broken the law to secure out-of-state insurance policies with larger payouts for his wife's and kids' deaths. Also, Camm allegedly had blood spatter on his shirt from his five-year-old daughter. According to his own account, he had never touched his daughter's body. He had, however, given his son's CPR, which could have resulted in that type of spray, but there was no further explanation for that discrepancy. Meanwhile, there was an errant sweatshirt not belonging to anyone in the Camm household that was found in the garage. The sweatshirt tested positive for unidentified DNA from a male and a female. Camm insisted the sweatshirt belonged to the real killer. Also, and this is the kicker, there were 11 witnesses who say they saw Camm playing basketball at the church at the



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

time Camm's family was killed. Anyway, the jury ended up finding David Camm guilty and he was sentenced to 195 years in prison.

[00:53:23] Dick blames Tom Bevel for this, but Tom Bevel was one of five blood spatter experts who testified for the state during the trial. More than two years later, the verdict was overturned, not because of the blood spatter testimony, but because it was determined that the judge should not have allowed the jury to hear about Camm's 15 affairs. After the verdict was overturned, the DNA on the sweatshirt finally came back with a hit. It belonged to a man who had recently been released from prison. And guess what? Turns out it was him who had killed Camm's wife and kids, not Camm.

[00:53:56] **Mandy Matney:** Talk about David Camm being the unluckiest man in the world. The Camm case is one that gets rolled out whenever Tom Bevel is on the scene. Dick wants the court and the public to believe that Bevel is some yokel cop from Oklahoma who uses tarot cards to explain bloodstains. But in truth, he has a lot of credibility. I would read through his credentials, but it would take too long. Now, here's the thing. If Dick and Jim want the court to believe that Bevel's conclusion of spatter is hot nonsense on the basis that he initially concluded there was no spatter, well, then, that too would be hot nonsense, right? Dick and Jim cannot have it both ways, so that brings us to Creighton and his response to all of this. We think this is something Creighton could have exploited. This expert is giving us mixed messages? Fine. Let's talk to some others then. Because look, despite what Dick and Jim say, it is entirely normal for experts to use photographs to draw their conclusions. The shirt was cut up into strips. The testing was done in phases. There are a number of explanations for changing the reports. If the state truly believes that there's significant spatter evidence on Alex shirt and that it can only have come from one thing, then they need to maintain that position. Instead, this is where Creighton went with it.

[00:55:36] **Creighton Waters:** We're in the process of assessing the viability of some of the information that's been gathered and how that affects this report and ultimately, whether or not it is anything the state intends to offer. What we've found out unfortunately is that that November report with the — was not provided to our office through the normal discovery. And in fact, I did not



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

receive that report until last Wednesday, November 30th when I literally was at SLED attempting to figure out our response to the motions after it had been filed. Of course, the day before Thanksgiving, I set up a meeting. We went out there and literally was out there going, what report are we talking about? And that's when the report actually first really came to my attention.

[00:56:23] **Judge Clifton Newman:** What report are you referring to?

[00:56:25] **Creighton Waters:** There is a November report, November 2021 report, Your Honor, in which SLED had tested various cuttings from the shirt with HemaTrace, which tests for human blood. And it did not identify human blood on those particular samples. And so, just to back up a little bit, obviously, the Attorney General's Office was not involved in this case for the first three months. I did not get involved until September of 2021. The case at the time was with the 14th Circuit. In July of 2021, SLED forensics were looking at various things they could do to test the shirt. And they applied a substance which is very common and commonly used called LCB to the shirt, which can react with blood. And that's what they keep talking about it being destroyed. It's not destroyed. The shirt is still there. It's just that a consequence of that testing on the shirt is that it then becomes discolored, so it's kinda purple. That's actually what it does so that you can see the alleged blood on there. During the course of that testing, after they did that, they then I think subsequent to that and I guess in September, they then reached out to Mr. Bevel. Again, SLED reached out to Mr. Bevel to get him to ultimately review the case. And then that process went forward. The Attorney General's Office, we had no involvement in any of the interaction, the only involvement that I did actually — process of dealing with Mr. Bevel was when they actually called me and said, hey, Mr. Bevel says that we can mail the shirt. And I said, no, you ain't mailing that shirt. This case is too important. I want it always in the custody, direct custody of a law enforcement officer. So, that was what I said at that time, but it was more about just the importance of this case and ensuring a major piece of evidence, it didn't get lost in the mail or something else happened that would affect chain of custody and —.

[00:58:26] **Liz Farrell:** So, that's great, right? His initial response was, we didn't do it. It was SLED. Also, what? The AG's office wasn't involved for the first three



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

months of this investigation? Who was? Oh, right. Alex's coworkers: 14th Circuit Solicitor Duffie Stone and his goon squad of investigators. A couple of things to note here. One is that Dick and Jim have been trying to make a big deal about SLED hand-carrying the shirt that Dick and Jim claim was destroyed to Oklahoma to the bloodstain expert. We now know that Creighton is the reason for that. He didn't trust that the chain of custody would remain intact otherwise. Another thing is this: we can't tell if Creighton is trying to downplay the importance of the shirt spatter because this is ultimately a case based on a totality of evidence, meaning the spatter is just one element of the case. But why oh why didn't he come out strong against the accusations of shenanigans? And why oh why didn't he outright tell the judge, once again, that the evidence is strong and that they're confident that these alleged discrepancies are the result of confusion? Judge Newman asked Creighton whether he plans to call Mr. Bevel to the stand, and instead of yes or no, Creighton answered this way.

[00:59:44] **Creighton Waters:** Well, and so, ultimately, when this report has come to light, the first thing that I did of course was talk to the SLED experts and talked to Mr. Bevel. And I said, how do we assess this? Is this, you know, how does this affect the report? Is it going to undermine at least that aspect of the report? Is it going to, the conclusions are still there but maybe not as strong or is it something that we need to not pursue? And obviously, I immediately started the — to begin that process of determining the effect of that evidence and that process is ongoing.

[01:00:18] **Mandy Matney:** So, that is what we're left with. Creighton says he needs more time to talk to everyone involved to find out what happened here. Why is there a report in which SLED says there's no blood on the shirt or no blood on certain parts of the shirt? Again, we don't know what they're saying in the report exactly. Creighton also needs more time to understand why the bloodstain expert said no spatter and what evidence he was analyzing at that point. If it turns out there's no good explanation, it sounds like the state is willing to reconsider the value of that evidence. And if that's the case, well, totality of evidence or not, juries like to see physical evidence. Obviously, we will be keeping a close eye on the developments here. We don't know what it all means right now, but if it turns out that the evidence is unusable, we will be calling out anyone who is responsible for that. And one



## EPISODE 72: Bad Blood & Bad Dudes - Accusations Fly in Double Homicide Hearing

---

last thing we wanna mention is about the death penalty. We've gotten a lot of questions over the past week about whether Alex Murdaugh could end up on death row as a result of this case. And the answer is yes. The state has until 30 days prior to the start of trial to tell the defense whether they plan to pursue this as a death penalty case or a life without parole case. That means Alex Murdaugh should know sometime around Christmas.

[01:01:57] We expect for this case to ramp up a lot in the next 60 days. Check out [mmp.supercast.com](http://mmp.supercast.com) so you won't miss a thing. Stay tuned and stay in the sunlight.

[01:02:21] **Outro:** The Murdaugh Murders Podcast is created and hosted by me, Mandy Matney, produced by my husband, David Moses. And Liz Farrell is our executive editor. From Luna Shark Productions.

---

PODCAST